



2010 Public Safety Radio Procurement Recommendations

Process Overview





Project Team

- Legal
 - Alan Miller, County Solicitor
 - Ron Williams, Fox-Rothschild
 - Levin Czubaroff, Fox-Rothschild
- Finance
 - Robert Patrizio, County CFO
- Administration
 - Ken Borkey, Deputy Chief Operations Officer





Project Team

- Technical Consultant
 - Mike Harper, L. Robert Kimball
- Department of Emergency Services
 - Todd Boughter, Senior Watch Officer
 - Kevin Neiswender, Training and QA Officer
 - Robert Zerman, Training and QA Officer
 - Brian Gottschall, Deputy Director

ALL DES PROJECT TEAM MEMBERS ARE ALSO
EMERGENCY RESPONDERS WITH OVER 15
YEARS OF EXPERIENCE





Process

- “Best Value” Procurement
 - Highly Technical Projects
 - In Compliance with State Established Procurement Requirements
 - Permits the Comparison of Different Approaches to Project Goals
- Permits the County to Evaluate Cost Deltas Against Value and Risk





Process

- Conceptual Design & RFP Release
- Proposals Received
- Q & A/Clarifications
- Short List Established By Objective Scoring
- Presentations and Second Proposal
- Equalization
- Interim Final Offering
- Final Proposal
- Contract Negotiations





Statistics

- 300 Page RFP
- 4 Vendors Anticipated
- 3 Vendors Responded
 - Harris
 - Motorola
 - Raytheon, JPS Communication
- One Proposal = Approx. 10" of Paper
- Well Over 1500 Man-Hours of Direct Deliberation Plus Independent Review





Primary Objectives

- Decrease Channel Congestion
- Increase System Coverage
- Improve Interoperability
 - Among Disciplines
 - With Out Of County Mutual Aid
- Accomplish Federal Narrow-banding Requirement





Secondary Objectives

- Implement a “Future-Proof” System
 - Expandability
 - Upgradeability
 - Project 25 + Where Appropriate
 - 2017 6 ¼kHz channel requirement
- Improve System Resiliency
- Establish Channel Capacity for non-Public Safety Entities
- Maintain Sanctity of Vendor/End-User Relationship





Procurement Drivers

- January 1, 2013 – Retirement of Existing VHF Systems
- Network Financeable Under Bond Sale
- Subscriber Hardware Available At Best Cost With Guaranteed Financing If Desired
- Long Term Cost of Ownership for All Parties





Proposal I and Q & A

- Evaluation Against RFP
- Questions and Answers (40-70 for each vendor)
- Objective Scoring Rating Both Network and Subscriber Hardware





Objective Scoring

- Network Infrastructure - 24 Specific Points
 - Overall Value
 - Pricing
 - Proposal
 - Equipment
 - Experience
- Subscriber Hardware – 12 Specific Points
 - Overall Value
 - Price
 - Equipment and Experience





Scoring Outcomes

Harris	Motorola	Raytheon
Bottom	Top	Middle
Middle	Top	Bottom

**Network
Infrastructure
Subscriber
Hardware**





Motto From Here Forward

***"NEGOTIATE
EARLY,
NEGOTIATE
OFTEN"***





Proposal II & Presentations

- Two Vendors Invited to Participate
 - Motorola
 - Raytheon
- Required a Second (Updated) Proposal
- (2) 12+ Hour Days of Presentations, Discussions, and Questions





Interim Final Proposals & Equalization

- Perhaps Most Important Part of Process
- Found to Be Highly Non-Conventional
- Improve Decision-Making Process
 - Reduction of Variables Between Proposals
 - Pick and Choose Features and Capabilities
 - Ability to “Leverage” Vendors By Comparing Their Proposals
 - Significant Price Modifications From Both Parties

The Coup De Grace In Decision-Making





Interim Final Proposals & Equalization

- Summary Documents From Each Vendor
 - 20 – 100 Pages
 - Outlined Intentions for Final Proposals
 - Provided the County With a Final Picture and Price
 - Gave the Opportunity for Last Minute Concessions on Price and Function





Subscriber Package Final Costs @ 1500 Subscribers

Motorola

Rep. Package
\$14,901,942.05
4 year Warranty

Guaranteed 5%
/ 60 month
Potential for
Additional Incentives

Raytheon

Rep. Package
\$15,080,281.40
1 year Warranty

Guaranteed 5%
/ 60 month





Subscriber Package Final Costs @ 3001 Subscribers

Motorola

Rep. Package
\$14,901,942.05
4 year Warranty

Guaranteed 5%
/ 60 month
Potential for
Additional Incentives

Raytheon

Rep. Package
\$14,427,169.80
1 year Warranty

Guaranteed 5%
/ 60 month





Infrastructure Final Costs

Motorola

Contract Package

\$24,941,338.75

Maintenance (5 year)

\$6,475,007.16

**Total 5 Year
Ownership**

\$31,416,345.91

Raytheon

Contract Package

\$21,549,603.02

Maintenance (5 year)

\$9,079,618.74

**Total 5 Year
Ownership**

\$30,620,221.76





2010 Public Safety Radio Procurement Recommendations

Contracting Recommendations





DES Final Recommendation - Subscribers

MOTOROLA

- Unanimous Decision of Review Team
 - Only subscriber package that met team satisfaction regarding form, fit, function.
- More Competitive Financing Package
- Cost Difference Is Not Quantifiable As a Factor





DES Final Recommendation - Infrastructure

MOTOROLA

- Unanimous Decision of Review Team
 - \$800 K (5) Year Cost Delta
 - Justified due to:
 - Vendor experience in project size and scope
 - Availability of TDMA at time of system deployment
 - Availability of highly desired proprietary feature sets
 - Flexibility in console deployment (multiple choices) with no cost differential





Final Recommendation - Consultant

TURNKEY AWARD - MOTOROLA

"Based on the evaluation of the proposals received, L. R. Kimball recommends that Berks County award the contract for this project to Motorola. There are a number of reasons for this recommendation including but not limited to the following:

- 1. Motorola's network and subscriber equipment proposals received the highest scores from the evaluation committee;*
- 2. Motorola has provided a robust highly reliable network design with multiple levels of system redundancy at both the network control and simulcast cell levels;*
- 3. Motorola has proposed deploying a Project 25 Phase 2 capable system at the outset, greatly increasing the capacity of the system at startup and removing the necessity to perform an extensive and possibly intrusive upgrade at a later date;*
- 4. Motorola offers remote programming of subscriber radios reducing the requirement to physically touch all radios to change radio programming;*
- 5. Motorola offers a radio console system that will require relatively little "re-training" of county dispatch personnel, simplifying the transition from the existing radio networks to the new system;*
- 6. Motorola has proposed a financing package that provides all Berks County user agencies with the ability to purchase radios and accessories at attractive fixed rates.*





Desired Additional Work

- Ability to Leverage Mobilization & Contract Costs to Accommodate Some Additional Work:
 - Inclusion of Centre Township site
 - Inclusion of asset management packageEstimated cost under \$500,000
- Dispatch Furniture
 - Vendor has already agreed to assignment of contractEstimated cost under \$500,000





Final Recommendation

The Department of Emergency Services recommends that the Commissioners of the County of Berks resolve to authorize the County Solicitor and DES Management to finalize contract negotiations between Berks County and Motorola Corporation to permit procurement of radio infrastructure and subscriber equipment of the type outlined today, with the final contract terms to be brought before the Board for execution.

Further, it is recommended that an amount of NTE \$31,034,300 (detail follows) be allocated for this project.





Budget Projections

\$ 2,300,000.00 County Subscriber Hardware
\$ 500,000.00 Furniture Contract
\$ 500,000.00 Owner Responsibilities
\$ 24,941,338.75 Radio Project Costs
\$ 2,992,960.65 Radio Project Contingency - 12%

\$ 31,234,299.40 Project Subtotal

\$ (200,000.00) External Funding (Furniture)

\$ 31,034,299.40 Project Total - Budget Request

**\$ 6,475,007.16 Future Commitment to Expenses
Over 5 Years**

